

The Map of Hadith Thought Among Western Scholars: An Analysis of Herbert Berg's Classification

Azhari Andi¹, Habib Arpaja²

¹Universitas Islam Internasional Indonesia (UIII) Jakarta, Indonesia

²Universitas Islam Negeri Sunan Kalijaga Yogyakarta, Indonesia

Article Information

Article history:

Received Januari 15, 2025

Revised May 09, 2025

Accepted June 20, 2025

Keywords

Hadith Classification;
Herbert Berg;
Historical-Critical Approach;
Hadith Studies;
Western Scholars

Correspondence

Azhari Andi

Universitas Islam
Internasional Indonesia (UIII)
Jakarta, Indonesia

E-mail:
habibarpaja26@gmail.com

A B S T R A C T

This article aims to analyze the classification and thought on Hadith among Western scholars through the perspective of Herbert Berg. This research employs a qualitative approach with descriptive-analytical methods, involving data collection from secondary sources such as Herbert Berg's scholarly works, journal articles, books, and other related literature. The analysis stages include identification, description, interpretation, comparison, and critical analysis of Berg's thought. The research findings show that Herbert Berg employs a historical-critical approach in his classification, emphasizing the historical and social context in understanding Hadith. This analysis reveals that Berg's thought significantly contributes to Hadith studies in the West by offering a new, more contextual, and critical perspective. The conclusion of this study asserts that Berg's classification and approach enrich the academic discourse in Hadith studies and provide a framework that can be used by future researchers. This research also fills a gap in the literature by providing a comprehensive analysis of Herbert Berg's contributions to Hadith studies, as well as offering a new perspective that future researchers can use in developing Hadith studies. The results of this research are expected to enrich academic discourse and become an important reference for academics interested in Hadith studies and Islamic studies in the West.

1. Introduction

The Qur'an and Hadith hold crucial roles as authoritative sources in Islam. It is no wonder that they have become compelling subjects for discussion from the classical era to the present day. The issue of authenticity is a significant topic in the study of the Qur'an and Hadith. For instance, in the early period of Islam, after the Prophet's death, the authenticity of the Qur'an garnered the attention of Muslims, leading to the idea of codifying the Qur'an and standardizing its recitation through the Uthmanic manuscript. Even in the modern era, the issue of the Qur'an's authenticity continues to be debated and remains a subject of interest. This can be observed, for example, in studies conducted by Western scholars such as John Wansbrough and others.

As time progressed, the issue of authenticity extended beyond the Qur'an to encompass the Hadith. The authenticity of Hadith has preoccupied classical Muslim scholars, prompting deep investigations into Hadith authenticity and the development of various sciences related to it, such as 'ilm jarh wa ta'dil, 'ilm rijal al-hadith, and others. Until the 20th century, the authenticity of Hadith remained a hotly debated topic, engaging not only Muslim scholars but also Western scholars.

The involvement of Western scholars in Hadith studies has introduced new dimensions with modern approaches and controversial viewpoints. Unlike Muslim scholars, Western scholars often use historical methods in their Hadith studies, leading many to conclude that the Hadith found in Islamic sources are fabrications or fictional stories that do not reflect actual events. In other words, they claim that the Hadith are forgeries and not derived from the Prophet. Notable figures who popularized this view include Ignaz Goldziher and Joseph Schacht.

However, within the Orientalist circle, there are those who oppose this view and believe that the Hadith in Islam can be trusted for their authenticity or truly originate from the Prophet. Among the Western scholars who support this view are Nabia Abbot, Fuad Sezgin, and M.M Azami. The debate over authenticity between the critics and defenders has colored Hadith studies in the West. This debate has also captured Herbert Berg's attention, prompting his involvement in Hadith studies. His masterpiece in Hadith studies is **The Development of Exegesis in Early Islam**. In this work, Herbert Berg classifies the debates on Hadith studies among Western scholars.

Research on Hadith studies among Western scholars has been conducted by various previous researchers. Ignaz Goldziher and Joseph Schacht are two influential figures in Hadith studies in the West. Goldziher, in his work, emphasizes that the Hadith in Islamic sources are the product of the Muslim community's fabrication in the second century of Hijra and not from the Prophet Muhammad. Joseph Schacht, Goldziher's successor, in his work **The Origins of Muhammadan Jurisprudence**, also reinforced a skeptical view on Hadith authenticity by examining Hadith chains (isnads) and concluding that the legal Hadith present today did not exist during the Prophet's time.

Contrary to Goldziher and Schacht, Nabia Abbot, Fuad Sezgin, and M.M Azami argue that the Hadith in Islam can be trusted for their authenticity. They conducted in-depth research

with different approaches and found evidence supporting the Hadith's authenticity. For instance, Fuad Sezgin, in his work, shows that the documentation of Hadith began during the Prophet's time, thus making the Hadith's authenticity more defensible.

Previous research has significantly contributed to understanding Hadith authenticity. However, there is a gap in this research that needs to be filled. Herbert Berg, in his work **The Development of Exegesis in Early Islam**, attempts to map the thoughts of Western scholars on Hadith and classify them into three categories: skepticism, sanguine, and middle ground. This classification provides a more comprehensive view of the debates among Western scholars and helps in understanding the various perspectives.

This research differs from previous studies by offering a clear and systematic classification of Western scholars' views on Hadith. Additionally, this research uses an in-depth historiographical approach to examine the isnad and matn of Hadith, providing a deeper understanding of Hadith authenticity from the perspective of Western scholars.

The research problem addressed in this article focuses on how Herbert Berg classifies and analyzes Hadith thought among Western scholars. This research identifies and analyzes the methods and approaches used by Herbert Berg in studying Hadith. Furthermore, this article seeks to understand how Berg's classification can contribute to a broader understanding of Hadith studies in the West. The gap addressed is the lack of in-depth studies mapping Berg's thoughts in the context of Hadith studies in the West and how these approaches can be compared to previous studies.

The expected outcome of this research is the development of a map of Hadith thought among Western scholars based on Herbert Berg's classification. This research is expected to make a significant contribution to understanding the methodology and approaches used in Hadith studies by Western scholars. Additionally, this research aims to fill the gap in the literature by providing a comprehensive analysis of Herbert Berg's contributions to Hadith studies and offering a new perspective that future researchers can use in developing Hadith studies. The results of this research are also expected to enrich academic discourse and serve as an important reference for academics interested in Hadith studies and Islamic studies in the West.

2. Method

This research uses a qualitative approach with descriptive-analytical methods to analyze Herbert Berg's thoughts on Hadith among Western scholars. This approach is chosen because it is suitable for examining complex phenomena involving intellectual thoughts and approaches in Hadith studies. The data used in this research come from secondary sources, including Herbert Berg's scholarly works, journal articles, books, and other relevant writings. Additionally, a literature review of previous studies related to this topic is conducted to provide a strong theoretical foundation and understand the context and development of Hadith studies in the West.

The data analysis is carried out in several stages, beginning with the identification and classification of Herbert Berg's works based on the main themes addressed in his writings. This step is followed by a detailed description and interpretation of Berg's thoughts to

understand the methods and approaches used in his Hadith studies. Subsequently, Berg's thoughts are compared with those of other scholars in Hadith studies in the West to find similarities, differences, and Berg's unique contributions. A critical analysis is then conducted to identify the strengths and weaknesses of Berg's approach and to evaluate his contribution to the development of Hadith studies among Western scholars.

To ensure the validity and reliability of the research, the collected data are analyzed critically, and triangulation is performed by comparing findings from various sources. The research procedures include a comprehensive literature review, in-depth analysis of Berg's works, comparison and contextualization of Berg's thoughts with other scholars, and the preparation of a comprehensive research report. With this research method, it is expected to gain a deep understanding of Herbert Berg's classification and thoughts on Hadith, as well as the contributions this research can provide to Hadith studies among Western scholars.

3. Results and Discussion

3.1. A brief history of Hadith Studies in the West

Throughout the scientific journey that colored Orientalism, Islamic studies carried out by the West were initially only aimed at Muslim religious material in general, such as literature and history.³ Especially at the beginning of the 8th century, the emergence of AD at the center of their attention was only focused on the Koran. Only recently, they have been directed specifically to the field of study of the prophet's hadith. Namely in the 19th century AD. In the 19th century, interest in the study of hadith emerged among Western scholars in a more specific framework. Ignaz Goldziher is considered a pioneer among Western scholars who studied hadith specifically and critically.⁴ Before Ignaz, several Western scholars had touched upon the study of hadith, such as Gustave Weil (1808-1889).⁵ However, he has not specifically and systematically discussed hadith as Ignaz Goldziher has done.

In this era, Western scholars questioned the authenticity, authorship, origin, accuracy and truth of hadith. Other things are also central issues in Islamic studies, especially in Islamic law. One of the factors that pushed hadith into an Orientalist study was the many contradictions or conflicts in the hadith corpus material itself. Seeing these facts, Western scholars doubt the authenticity of the hadith. In subsequent developments, many western scholars emerged who dedicated their knowledge to studying hadith. Among them there are differences of opinion, not only different theories, but also different conclusions. There are those who sue and there are those who defend the hadith. This debate was then simplified by Herbert Berg with his classification. This discussion will be presented in the next sub-theme.

3.2. Getting to know Herbert Berg

Herbert Berg is of German ethnic descent, but he was born in Brazil in 1964. A year later or in 1965, his family moved to Ontario, Canada and remained there until 1989. Herbert Berg pursued his academic pursuits at Waterlio at the high school known as with Oxford District Secondary School. He masters various languages, from German, English to Arabic. After completing high school, Berg continued his studies at the University of Waterloo majoring in Mathematics. He earned a Bachelor's degree in Mathematics / Honors Computer Science in 1988. Apart from studying Mathematics, Herbert Berg also studied Eastern studies

which he studied at the same University. In 1989, Berg earned a bachelor's degree in science arts, Honours Religious Studies/ Middle Eastern Studies.⁶

After completing his undergraduate education, Berg decided to delve into oriental studies, so he took a concentration Master of Arts, Centre for Religious Studies at the University of Toronto and earned a master's degree in 1990. At the same campus, Berg continued his doctoral education in Philosophy, Centre for Religious Studies and graduated in 1996. While pursuing his doctoral education, Berg was also active in teaching at the University of Toronto as an assistant lecturer at Department of Middle East and Islamic Studies and Department of Religious Studies (1990-1992). In addition, Berg also served as Instructor Division of Humanities at York University (1992-1994) and instructor of Department of Religious Studies at the University of Toronto (1993-1994). Berg also held the same position at Middlebury College (1994-1995) and taught at Department of Religion at the University of Vermont.

After completing his doctoral program in 1996, Berg's career became even more brilliant. He is believed to be Assistant Visiting Professor in Department of Philosophy and Religious Studies and Department of Near Eastern Studies at Cornell University (1997-2003). Berg's experience teaching at various universities led him to become a lecturer and program director Graduate Liberal Studies at the University of North Carolina Wilmington.

Apart from teaching at various universities, Berg is also active in writing. He is a productive figure. Berg has written many works in the form of books, journal articles and reviews. Among his works in book form are *The Development of Exegesis in Early Islam: The Debate over the Authenticity of Muslim Literature from the Formative Period* (2000), *Method and Theory in The Study of Islamic Origins* (2003), *The Quest for the Historical Muhammad* (ed.) Ibn Waraq (2000) dan *A Reader's Guide to the Quran: A Collection of Resource Materials* collaboration with Andrew Rippin.

His work in the form of articles can be found in various journals, such as: "Early African American Muslim Movements and the Quran dalam *Journal of Quranic Studies*, forthcoming", "Tabari's Exegesis of the Quranic Term al-Kitab" dalam *Journal of the American Academy of Religion* (1995), "Weaknesses in the Argument for the Early Dating of tafsir" dalam *In With Reverence for the Word: Medieval Scriptural Exegesis in Judaism, Christianity and Islam* edited by Jane Dammen Mc. Auliffe, "Context: Muhammad" in *Blackwell Companion to the Quran*, edited by Andrew Rippin and others. Berg also wrote several reviews, among others *The Formation of the Classical Tafsir Tradition: The Quran Commentary of al-Tsa'labi* by Walid A. Saleh dalam *International Journal of Middle East Studies* (2005), *Quranic Studies: Source and Methods of Scriptural interpretation* by John Wonsborough dalam *The Journal of Religion* (2006), *Islamic humanities* by Lenn E. Goodman in *International Philosophical Quarterly* (2004) and others.

3.3. A glance at the book "The Development of Exegesis in Early Islam"

Book *The Development of Exegesis in Early Islam* is Berg's masterpiece in the study of hadith. In preparing and completing this book, Berg received a lot of support from various institutions, such as the Social Sciences and Humanities Research Council of Canada, the Centre of the Study of Religion at the University of Toronto, the Department of Religion at

Middlebury College, the Department of Religion at the University of Vermont, the Department of Near Eastern Studies at Cornell University, and the Department of Philosophy and Religion at the University of North Carolina at Wilmington. Apart from that, Berg also received support from colleagues and professors such as Daniel Sahas, Willard G. Oxtoby, B. Tod Lawson, Jane Mc Auliffe, Kevin Reihart, Andrew Rippin⁷ and so on.

Berg's work is somewhat different from the works of other Western scholars, because Western scholars generally directly refer to the book of hadith in their studies, such as Ignaz Goldziher, who conducted an in-depth study of the book. Sahih Bukhari,⁸ and Joseph Schacht thoroughly examines the book al-Muwaththa' the work of Imam Malik.⁹ However, Berg chose to make Tafsir al-Thabari as the material object, more specific are the hadiths narrated by Ibnu Abbas in Tafsir al-Thabari. In his book Berg reveals the reasons why he chose the book Tafsir al-Thabari not other books as the material object of his research. Among them is because al-Thabari is a famous classical interpreter and his interpretive works are among the first interpretive works in Islam,¹⁰ In addition, al-Tabari's interpretation uses many hadiths along with the interpretations of the Companions and Tabi'in on verses of the Koran. Because friends and tabi'in are historical actors, the accuracy of the historical record is close to the truth. Apart from that, Berg suspects that there is an al-Tabari theological agenda in selecting the hadiths¹¹ oral which makes it possible to see further how accurate al-Tabari was in selecting a hadith.¹²

Meanwhile, the hadith narration of Ibn Abbas in tafsir al-Tabari chosen by Berg with the following views: 1) many orientalist are skeptical of Ibn Abbas's narrative, such as Noldeke;¹³ 2) Ibn Abbas is known famous and widely referred to in legal problems by the early generations of Islam to commentators of the Qur'an other than al-Tabari.¹⁴ Apart from that, Ibn Abbas was a mufassir among friends and also had the status of the prophet's nephew¹⁵ So Berg assumed that by researching Ibn Abbas's history, Berg was able to get an idea of the history of the prophethood by examining the isnad of Ibn Abbas's narrative. To see further the authenticity of the Prophet's hadith through Ibn Abbas's transmission route, Berg uses John Wansbrough's theory, namely exegetical device.

Book *The Development of Exegesis in Early Islam* Berg's work was first printed by Routledge, New York in 2000. Berg reviews the discussion of hadith in seven chapters arranged systematically. In chapter I, Berg raises the problem of the validity of isnad or the appropriateness of isnad which is a guarantee of the authenticity of Islamic literature. In chapter II, Berg explains the history of hadith and its authenticity according to recent scholars, then Berg makes conclusions about the thoughts of Western scholars by classifying their thoughts into three categories, skeptic, sanguine and middle ground. In chapter IV, Berg presents a methodology for studying hadith. It uses theory exegetical device Wansbrough. Wansbrough's approach and methods influenced Berg in his work. At the beginning of his book, Berg admits that he was introduced to John Wansbrough's thinking by Todd Lawson.¹⁶ In chapter V, Berg carries out a consistency analysis of usage exegetical device of the interpretive hadiths narrated through Ibn Abbas's transmission route. Berg concluded that some of Ibn Abbas's isnads are not historical facts yang sebenarnya (These particulars Isnad are not a reliable source of historical information).¹⁷ Finally, in chapter VI, he provides the conclusions of his research.¹⁸

3.4. Classification of Western Scholars' Views on the Authenticity of Herbert Berg's Version of Hadith

The debate about the authenticity of Hadith among Western scholars has attracted Berg's attention to directly researching Hadith. Apart from jumping in and engaging directly with Hadith, Berg mapped the study of Hadith among Western scholars. According to Berg, at least Western scholars' thoughts about Hadith can be classified into three categories, namely scepticism, sanguine and middle ground. Regarding these three categories, Berg does not provide explicit definitions, but he includes figures who are members of each category.

3.4.1. Scepticism

Most Muslims believe that the Hadith is the second source of Islamic authority after the Koran, an important Hadith literature of influence and a source of religious law and inspiration. Scholars have worked hard to collect and classify, and sort out authentic and false traditions. Hadith scholars in the early to third centuries of the Hijriyah did not explicitly define traditions that could be considered authentic. They only set the criteria for the information obtained, including, namely, that the narrator of the hadith is a known person *tsiqqah*, *adil* and *firm* and the narrated *matan* does not contain 'god and *Shaz*.¹⁹ However, since the 19th century, doubts will come and authentic traditions have emerged among Western scholars. This group of doubters is categorized by Berg as scepticism. The Western scholars who Berg categorized into this category were Ignaz Goldziher, Joseph Schachth and E. Stetter.

Ignaz Goldziher is of Jewish descent. He was born in Hungary on June 22 1850 and died in Budhaphes on November 13 1921. Goldziher was the first Western scholar to study Hadith specifically and critically in the West through his work *Muhammadan Studies* which was published in 1890. Goldziher conducted an in-depth Hadith study by examining the hadiths in the *Sahih Bukhari* book, especially the hadiths related to politics, sectarianism and culture by using a historical approach.²⁰

From his research, Ignaz Goldziher concluded that the Prophet's Hadith was a fabrication by the Muslim community who lived in the second century Hijriyah. In other words, hadith is a fake product. Ignaz Goldziher stated that there are at least four motives that cause the proliferation of hadith falsification among Muslims, including political, legal, sectarian and communal/historical interests. However, political motives, according to Ignaz Goldziher, are the dominant factor in fostering hadith forgery. In particular, Ignaz Goldziher said that it was the Umayyad Dynasty that produced many fake hadiths. Like the hadith about the superiority of the three mosques (the Mosques of Mecca, Medina and Jerusalem).²¹

Goldziher even stated that the Umayyad Dynasty carried out massive acts of forgery of Hadith and spread them based on political factors or motives. Therefore, the Umayyad Dynasty protected and sponsoring the codification of Hadith. One of the earliest Hadith collectors, Ibn Syihab al-Zuhri, is mentioned by Goldziher as a scholar who collaborated with the Umayyad government in spreading Hadiths that supported them.²² According to Goldziher, the authenticity of the hadiths codified in Muslim sources cannot be confirmed. Furthermore, Goldziher concluded that the hadith was a product of the Muslim community in the second century Hijriah and did not originate from the prophet Muhammad at all.

Ignaz Goldziher's views are so well known among Western scholars that they have influenced many other figures. One of them is Joseph Schacht. Schacht is the successor to Goldziher, who shares a skeptical view of the authenticity of hadith. Schacht was born on March 15, 1902 in Rottbur, Germany.²³ It also colors the study of Hadith among Western scholars. His masterpiece in the study of Islamic studies is *An Introduction to Islamic Law* which was published by Oxford University Press in 1964 and *The Origins of Muhammadan Jurisprudence*.

Schacht specifically conducted research on books *al-Muwatha'* to test the authenticity of the hadith. However, Schacht focuses on hadith sanads that connect the narrators to the prophet, especially legal hadiths. Schacht argues that Islamic law as codified in Islamic sources and famous today actually did not exist at the time of the Prophet Muhammad or even in the first two centuries of Islam. Furthermore, Schacht is of the opinion that the hadiths in the *mu'tabar* books are only the invention of scholars who lived two or three centuries after the death of the Prophet Muhammad. These hadiths grew and originated from *halaqah* and legal debates of classical scholars in the main cities of the Umayyad dynasty such as Makkah, Medina, Kufa, and Basrah in the 2nd/3rd century.²⁴ To strengthen their opinion about law, scholars and hadith scholars during the Umayyad Dynasty attributed their 'words' to the prophet in order to be more authoritative. People or individuals who falsify hadith are called by Schacht with common link. Schacht's view is in line with Goldziher's view that hadith only appeared in the second century Hijriah. Judging from Ignaz and Schacht's views, it can be concluded that the skeptical group is those who are skeptical about the authenticity of the prophet's hadith or conclude that all the prophet's hadith are not authentic.

3.4.2. Sanguine

Western scholars' skeptical views on the authenticity of hadith have invited a number of figures to revisit these skeptical views. They try to counter skeptical opinions. And these figures are categorized by Schacht into the sanguine group. The Western scholars who are included in the sanguine category by Schacht are Nabia Abbot, Fuad Sezgin and M. M Azami.

Nabia Abbott is a Western scholar who strongly opposes the views of Goldziher and his friends. He is a professor at the University of Chicago. His work *Studies in Arabic Literary Papyri* is his rebuttal to Goldziher and Schacht's theory regarding the authenticity of Hadith discourse. To counter Goldziher and Schacht's views, Abbot conducted research on papyrus documents dating from the second half of the 8th century and the beginning of the 9th century AD. In contrast to Goldziher and Schacht who concluded that the hadith had not been narrated in the early period of Islam and had only just appeared in the second century, Abbott on the contrary concluded that the transmission of hadith had been going on since the first centuries of Islam, both orally and in writing.²⁵ Abbott's view is in line with the view of Muslim scholars.

Regarding Goldziher's accusation that the Umayyad Dynasty was actively involved in falsifying hadiths, especially those related to politics, Abbot said that the Umayyad Dynasty was actually busy collecting Prophetic Hadiths relating to matters of administration and government management such as taxes and zakat, not those that legitimized power. they.²⁶ 'Umar ibn 'Abd al-'Aziz (d. 101/720) in this case was a very meritorious figure who was famous among Muslims. In short, Abbot, based on his research on the hadiths contained in

documents from the 9th century, concluded that the hadiths were not fabricated by Muslims in the second century of the Hijriah, but were actually transmitted continuously to the prophet and his companions.

M. M. Azami, an Indian-born Muslim scholar also took part in countering the opinion of the skeptic group, especially Joseph Schacht. Azami wrote a book *Dirasat fi al-Hadith al-Nabawi wa Tarikh Tadwinihi* specifically to refute the misleading views of the skeptic group. Azami believes that the process of recording Hadith began during the time of the Prophet Muhammad. To support his opinion, Azami provides concrete evidence that the hadith had been recorded long before the second century, as alleged by Ignaz and Schacht. Azami pointed out that the hadiths had been written down by Muslims in the form of shahifahs.²⁷ Tuduhan shaft Azami considered it to be Schacht's lack of understanding of the *ulumul hadith*. Azami's view is in line with Nabia About where they agree that hadith were written and recorded long before the second century Hijriah.

3.4.3. Middle Ground

Schacht does not define explicitly what is meant by middle ground. However, from his presentation it can be concluded that the middle ground group is a group that is looking for a middle ground between skepticism and sanguineness. Among the figures included in this group are G.H.A Jyuinball, Fazlur Rahman, G. Schoeler, H. Motzki, J. Horovits, J.W. Fuck, Jj. Robbson, U. Rubbin, and J. Coulson.²⁸

Jyuinball is a Dutch-born scholar who continues Schacht's common link theory. Jyuinball comes to a different conclusion from Schacht that the origins of Hadith can be traced back to the time of the Prophet. However, he added that "it is almost impossible for us to find a fairly successful method for proving the historicity of the attribution of a Hadith to the Prophet except in certain examples." Meanwhile, Fazlur Rahman, a Muslim scholar, is of the view that the intellectualist view of the prophet is indeed correct, but only at the mathematical level, but not regarding the concept of *sunnah*. According to Rahman, the *Sunnah* not only includes the practices of the Prophet himself, but also the interpretation of the *Sunnah*. The *Sunnah*, which was then colored by *ijtihad* and *ijma'*, ultimately gave birth to the 'Living Tradition' (living tradition) of Muslims as an ideal and authentic expression of Islamic teachings.²⁹ This is the view of several Middle Ground figures.

3.5. Evaluation and Analysis of Herberg Bert Mapping

The mapping carried out by Herberg Berg provides a new color in the study of Orientalist hadith. The mapping carried out by Berg makes it easier for novice scholars in the study of hadith to distinguish hadith thinking among Orientalists. However, in his presentation, Berg did not provide a specific definition of groups Sceptism, Middle Ground and Sanguine.³⁰ Despite this, the classification of Berg's version in *The Development of Exegesis in Early Islam: The Authenticity of Muslim Literature from the Formative Period*, according to the author, it is mapped based on thoughts or products of thought, where claimants to the authenticity of hadith are categorized into the Skeptic group. Meanwhile, groups that defend or strengthen the authenticity of hadith are categorized as Sanguine. And between the two groups that are arguing fiercely above is called Middle Ground.

Berg's version of classification is not the only mapping of orientalist hadith thought. There is another classification carried out by Halard Motzki. Motzki categorizes Orientalist thought in hadith based on dating. In general, there are three groups in the study of hadith among Orientalists according to Motzki, namely calendar based the women, a year and isnad cum matan.³¹ The first group, undergraduates who do dating based on Matan are Ignaz Goldziher, Joseph Schacht, and Marston Speight. The second group, undergraduates who do dating based on isnads such as Joseph Schach, Jyuinball and others. The third group, undergraduates who do dating based on sanad cum matan such as Hendrik Kramers (1953) and Joseph van Ess published (1975).

However, the author considers that the classification carried out by Berg is sufficient to guide novice readers in studying Orientalist hadith thinking. Berg's version of mapping in turn inspired other Western scholars to calcify Orientalist hadith thinking

4. Conclusion

Hadith studies have attracted the interest of Western scholars, especially in the 19th and 20th centuries, with the main theme being the authenticity of hadith. This discourse has brought Western scholars into heated debate. Seeing this debate, Berg tried to map the views of Western scholars regarding hadith into three groups. First, Scepticism represented by Ignaz Goldziher, Joseph Schacht and E. Setter. Group Scepticism is of the view that hadith is a product of Muslim engineering in the second century of the Hijriah which is full of political overtones and does not really come from the prophet and friends. Second, group sanguine represented by Nabia Abott, F. Sezgin and M.M Azami. They criticized the skeptical group and showed that the hadith really came from the prophet and companions and had been written long before the second century of the Hijriah, unlike the accusations of the skeptical group. Third, Middle Ground, represented by G.H.A Jyuinball, Fazlur Rahman, G. Schoeler, H. Motzki, J. Horovits, J.W. Fuck, Jj. Robbison, U. Rubbin, and J. Coulson. This group are scholars who take the middle path of the fierce debate between skeptics and sanguines.

References

- Abbott, Nabia. *Studies in Arabic Literary Papyri*. Chicago: The University of Chicago Press. 1957-1972.
- Ajaj al-Khatib, *Ushul al-Hadith; Ulmumuha wa Musthauha*. Beirut: Dar al-Kutub al- 'ilmiyah. 2004
- Amin, Komarudin. *Menguji Kembali Keakuratan Metode Kritik Hadis*, (Jakarta: Hikmah. 2009.
- Azami, M.M. *Hadits Nabawi dan Sejarah Kodifikasinya*. ter. Ali Mustafa Yaqub. Jakarta: Pustaka Firdaus. 1994.
- Badawi, Abdurrahman. *Ensiklopedi Tokoh Orientalis*. Yogyakarta: LkiS, cet-II, 2003.
- Berg, Herbert. *The Development of Exegesis in Early Islam*. New York: Routledge, 2000.
- Haris, Abdul. "Genealogi Kajian Hadis Orientalis" disampaikan pada perkuliahan Kajian Hadis Orientalis SQH UIN Sunan Kalijaga. Maret 2019.
- Muhammad Ma'mun, "Dari Muir hingga Motzki; Asal Usul Hukum Islam dalam Kajian Orientalisme" dalam *Jurnal Ahwal*. Vol. 5. Tahun 2013

- Motzki, Harald. "Dating Muslim Traditions: A Survey", dalam Arabica. Leiden: Koninklijke Brill. 2005.
- Schacht, Joseph. An Introduction to Islamic Law. Oxford: The Clarendon Press, 1964.
- Schacht, Joseph. The Origins of Muhammadan Jurisprudence. Oxford: The Clarendon Press, 1964.
- Ya'qub, Ali Mustafa. Kritik Hadis. Jakarta: Pustaka Firdaus. 2008.